Ecuador: Discrimination of Lesbian, Bisexual, Transsexual, Transgender and Intersex Women

Shadow Report
For consideration within the review of Ecuador’s compliance with the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW)

September 2008

Prepared and submitted by Women’s Communication Workshop
(Taller de Comunicación Mujer)
Soledad Varea and Tatiana Cordero

Acknowledgements

Silueta X Alianza Exclusiva para Mujeres Transgéneros: Guayaquil Diane Klein Rodriguez.
Red Trans de El Oro: Karem Paz.
Miembro Trans de la Comunidad GLBT. Mónica Rodríguez
Proyecto Casa Trans. Elízabeth Vásques, Ana Almeida, Nicole, Shirley.
Asociación ALFIL: Rashell Erazo
Red LAC Trans.

Con el apoyo de IGLHRC - Comisión Internacional de los Derechos Humanos para Gays y Lesbianas

Summary

Historically, LGBTTI women have been marginalized, if not made invisible, within Ecuadorian society. While sexual orientation—but not also gender identity—was included among the nondiscrimination criteria in the Constitution, this did not reduce discrimination of lesbian women as no comprehensive mechanism was developed towards this end. Trans women and intersex persons lack protection against discrimination in both law and practice. Discrimination affects these women in areas including education, employment, and access to medical services, including in emergency situations. Most importantly, their rights to lives free from violence and equal to those of other citizens have been continually ignored.

The drafting of a new Constitution, following President Rafael Correa’s assumption of power in 2007, has served as a pivotal window of opportunity for the LGBTTI community. Several women’s groups within Ecuador have submitted proposals. They seek the establishment and implementation of a non-discriminatory mechanism inclusive of gender identity, pervasive gender-neutrality (particularly in reference to workplace accessibility and political decision-making), the decriminalization of abortion, enactment of civil partnership irrespective of the gender of the partners, and the definition of violence against LGBTTI people as hate crimes, and punishable as such.

1 Translation from Spanish by Joanna Hoffman sponsored by the International Gay and Lesbian Human Rights Commission (IGLHRC) in a program of supporting local activists' participation in CEDAW country reviews.
identity. These clinics need to be closed immediately and those responsible need to be investigated.

Temporary measures are needed immediately to protect LGBTTI people against violence and abuse in numerous settings, such as that committed by police, family members, public and private institutions. Longer-term measures should recognize homophobia and transphobia as precursors and contributors to the murders of LGBTTI people and to other human rights violations.

This report captures stories of women who had once been voiceless. Lesbian women, *travesti* and transsexuals, allied themselves with other feminist women, and question the heteronormative view in society, marriage as a patriarchal institution, and have emphasized the need to decriminalize abortion. They work with other social movements towards the fulfillment of human rights for all Ecuadorians, regardless of sexual orientation and gender identity.

**Introduction**

Beginning in the 1980s, the women's movement joined together to collectively express demands, develop public policy proposals, and establish a dialogue with the State. As a result, a process of gender-focused institutionalization marked the 1990s in the form of women's political participation in the formal structures of politics and government. Therefore, important political and social representations of women took place. During this decade, the following laws were adopted: the Law Against Violence to Women and to Family (1995), the Law of Free Maternity and the Law of Labor Support, better known as the Law of Electoral Quotas (1997). In the same year, the National Council of Women (CONAMU) was created as well.

In 1998, a new Constitution was written which incorporated 34 of the 36 demands by women's groups, such as: the right to personal integrity and to a life free from violence; to equality before the law and anti-discrimination; to equal participation among men and women in the popular election process and in times of direction and decision-making in the public arena, in judicial administration, in management institutions and in political parties; the right to make free and responsible decisions regarding one's sexual and reproductive life; equality and co-responsibility in the family; support for female-headed households; non-discriminatory education that promotes gender equity; coed education; and the obligation of public policy and institutions to work for women's equality².

---

² Economic, social and cultural rights are included in Article 34 of the Constitution, which states regarding gender equality that: “The State will guarantee equal rights and opportunities for women and men to access production resources and in making economic decisions in the administration of society and property”.

As for the family, Article 37- “Family, Motherhood and Marriage”- states that: “The State will recognize and protect the family as a fundamental unit of society and will guarantee the conditions which integrally favor the attainment of its goals. This will be constituted by legal bonds or fact and will be based upon the equality of rights and opportunities for its members”. Furthermore, “The state will protect marriage, motherhood and the family. Equally, it will support women-headed households”.

Responsible fatherhood and motherhood is advocated; as well, as indicated in Article 41, “The State will formulate and execute policies to advance equal opportunities between women and men, through the specialized law-making institutions, which will incorporate a focus on gender into plans and programs,
On the other hand, the 1994 decision of the InterAmerican Commission of Human Rights of the Organization of American States (OAS) regarding cases of physical violence and murder of homosexuals marked the first insistence to the Ecuadorian government that the rights of sexually diverse people be guaranteed. In 1997, gay and lesbian activists, feminists, men and women of varying sectors, came together to declare the unconstitutionality of the first paragraph of Article 516 of the Penal Code, which classified homosexuality between two consenting male adults as a punishable crime with a sentence of four to eight years. This reform occurred after numerous efforts following acts of discrimination in public arenas, particularly in the city of Cuenca, where physical violence, detention, and violations of rights to privacy and personal intimacy occurred.

Despite the numerous advances in the 1990s for the women's movement and for sexually diverse people, as shown by the CEDAW Concluding Observations announced to the government, conditions of life and well being have deteriorated, as has access to health and education. Additionally, “…we have not been able to penetrate the ideological structures of society nor the intimate structures of human beings” (Rodas, 2002). Also, there has been a silencing of those who are different, and their demands.

Two of the most important accomplishments achieved throughout these past few decades by the women's and LGBTTI movements, respectively, were the “Law Against Violence Against Women” and the inclusion of sexual orientation in the definition of “anti-discrimination”; however, even in this context lesbian and trans women had been excluded and made invisible.

This is reflected in the fact that, despite Ecuador being a signatory of the Convention Against Torture, transsexuals, travestis and lesbians have been victims of forced confinement and torture in “rehabilitation” clinics. These types of cases were first documented in 2005 by the Regional Tribunal for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. This brought to light the fact that the existing civil rights protections were not

and will provide technical assistance for this necessary application in the public sector.” There is a reference to vulnerable groups in Section 5, Article 47, which states that: “Pregnant women, disabled persons, those suffering from severe, complex illnesses and the elderly will receive priority attention in the public and private realms.

Accordingly, this will also apply to people in dangerous situations, such as victims of domestic violence, child abuse, natural or manmade disasters”.

In conclusion we can see that our country has advanced in the promotion and ratification of laws which protect women's rights, although in practice women's struggles have joined together in the Women's Movement, and within this movement there are different scopes of work, watching for and demanding the fulfillment of legal, administrative and social norms so that we can live lives that are healthy and free of violence.

4 In this document, the word “trans” is understood as women-transsexuals, transgender and travestis.
5 In this document, we would like to point out that the trans community and lesbian women have in common a specific kind of violence, related with the imprisonment in “de-homosexualization” clinics which have the objective of transforming sexual identity and are legitimately located in Quito and Guayaquil as of 2001, according to a report by Taller de Comunicación Mujer (2007).
6 The cases of forced imprisonment of lesbian women are of those who presented their stories at the Regional Tribunal in Quito, Ecuador and Lima, Peru.
sufficient to create an environment in which lesbian women can live their sexuality. This produced, for the first time, a public, political presence of lesbian women fighting against the historical tradition of invisibility. These cases were also presented to the media, taken note of by the press and presented as acts of vigilance. It was also recommended that the State investigate these practices. The State's lack of response towards acts of violence illuminated the lack of protection for LGBTTI people, particularly lesbian women, travestis, transsexuals, and transgender people, as evidenced by the State's failure to take necessary administrative and legal measures to ensure the closure of these clinics and for those responsible for imprisonment and torture to be punished judicially. Furthermore, the Ministry of Health and CONSEP (the National Council of Psychotropical and Stupefying Substances) were aware of these occurrences, however did not give them adequate attention and remained indifferent.

Currently a new Constitution is in development, following Rafael Correa's assumption of power in January 2007. In April of this year, the Constitutional Reformation was approved and a Constituent Assembly of plenary powers was established. This way, the government proposed a consultative process, which includes ample citizen participation in expanding the previous Constitution. For this process, a commission was designed which is composed of jurists representing universities and the government, within the National Council of Superior Education (CONESUP). This commission received proposals on writing the new Constitution from social and political groups. In this process the women's movement presented at least four proposals from women's organizations.

At the present conjuncture, one can see a process of consolidation and visibility of lesbian women, travesti and transsexuals, who have allied themselves with other feminist women. This political alliance of groups has questioned marriage as a patriarchal institution and has emphasized the need to decriminalize abortion.

In this process, the relationships between the categories of gender identity and sexual choice are very important. For example, “...domestic femicides behind closed doors as compared with transphobic violence in the streets, as well as the vindication of the right to abortion and that of the right of a trans person to sexual reassignment surgery, all...”

---

8 Causana
9 Before the ombudsman (la defensoria del pueblo) (CLADEM-Ecuador-Causana)
10 In the first session of the EPU, questions were posed in relation to incidents of torture and abuse against sexual minorities.
12 In September 2007, the government of Ecuador issued Decree No 620, which declared a political commitment to the eradication of gender-based violence beginning in childhood. To implement it, a plan was developed which called for “the generation and implementation of actions and measures, including joint coordinating and communicative mechanisms, on all levels of the State”, at the time affirming that this public policy “initiates the construction of a non-authoritative culture that can contribute much to the “people's revolution” that the current government is pursuing, incorporating women as full actors, free from violence.
13 A set of organizations such as Luna Creciente, OML, Forum of Ecuadorian Women, among others. In addition, there are other proposals by lesbian, feminist and transfeminist collectives such as Casa Feminista Rosa and the Coalition for the Decriminalization of Abortion and Against Poverty.
14 Casa Trans, Casa de Rosa, Causana and Collective of Women Defying Myths, Taller de Comunicación Mujer.
have to do with decisions over one's own body”.

Following these alliances, the proposals of lesbian and trans women for the Constitution are the following: a non-discriminatory system, the detailed and progressive account (as from the 1998 Constitution) of the Sexual and Reproductive Rights, recognition of alternative families and de-facto partnerships, irrespective of the partners’ gender. They also added the articulation on the right to life that, at last, permits an end to the criminalization of abortion in secondary legislation. In addition, they added the criminalization of hate crimes based on gender and sexual diversity, the collective ownership and demand of rights, ample protection and structure from the depoliticized Constitutional Court, and the use of lay ethics as principles of interpreting legal norms. However, the new constitutional proposal is not yet in effect, and it is on the State to give attention to the violation of rights within the current legal frame, which is the 1998 Constitution.

**Article 1: Definition of the concept of discrimination**

In regards to the Concluding Observations articulated by the Committee in 2003 on the persistence of discriminatory concepts in penal and civil rights, and the disparity between the protection of women in law and in fact, as well as regarding the necessity of repealing the discriminatory dispositions in penal and civil legislation, the Ecuadorian state has not yet made substantial legal changes in those instances, institutions and environments which produce discrimination against women, such as the family, nor has it paid attention to the social and cultural practices which sustain them.

Although legislative advances exist, the measures taken as of now by the State were based on a heteronormative binary conception of genders, based on biology and on gender stereotypes. This impacts the conception of subjects, citizenship, and the formulation of rights, their applications and their guarantees.

The concept of what is human, which is largely fixed in Ecuadorian society, is biologically determined. Gender identity is conceived of as one's innate characteristic, determined by a sex and by a body that is “naturally pure”. Men and women, as representations of the masculine and the feminine, are explained from a concept of what is “normal” and “natural”. The body and gender identity are not understood as social and historical constructions, leading to a tension with the masculine and feminine hegemony. For that reason, discrimination is a daily occurrence for those who do not conform to the stereotypes of biological, feminine women, such as those who do not conform to the heteronormative, patriarchal model.

As a result, the combination of attitudes expressed by the executive and judicial powers do not reflect the application of non-discrimination to lesbian and trans women, nor is it an adequate response to the Committee's observations. In this situation, it is clear that lesbian and trans women are not seen as people deserving of rights, insofar as their gender identity and sexual orientation are not respected. In both cases, this exclusion takes the form of violence. That is to say, the State's failure to recognize lesbian and trans women places them in dangerous situations in private and public settings, and leaves unpunished violence, torture, sexual abuse, rape and discrimination in educational, health and workforce institutions. This affects their enjoyment of freedom and rights.

---

15Interview with Elizabeth Vásquez.
In truth, inequality has not yet been addressed under the law. Although sexual orientation has been incorporated into the principle of anti-discrimination, discriminatory acts have not been defined in the law, and secondary anti-discrimination legislation has not been elaborated. Antidiscrimination principles have not been applied to gender identity either. Therefore, acts of discrimination and violations of human rights against these women have yet to be sanctioned.

We ask the Honorable Committee to recommend to the State of Ecuador:

1.1 To prohibit discriminatory acts towards LGBTTI in any situation and to impose respective sanctions.
1.2 To extend the concept of discrimination to include gender identity.
1.3 To implement public policies that include gender identity and sexual orientation and that guarantee the rights of lesbian and trans women.

Article 2: Policies and Legislation Aimed at Ending Discrimination in the National Constitution

This refers to the fact that the States which condemn discrimination against women in all forms, agree upon the following, at all appropriate costs and without delay, a policy aimed at eliminating discrimination against women and, with this goal, commit to:

a) To consecrate, if they have not already, in their national constitutions and in any other relevant legislation the principle of equality between men and women, and to ensure through law and other appropriate methods the practical realization of this principle;

b) To adopt adequate measures, legally and otherwise, with corresponding sanctions, which prohibit all forms of discrimination against women;

c) To establish judicial protection of women's rights, based upon equality with men, and to guarantee, through the actions of national tribunals and other public institutions, effective protection for women against all acts of discrimination.

d) To prevent the occurrence of any act or practice of discrimination against women, and to ensure that the authorities and institutions act in accordance with this obligation;

e) To take appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination against women practiced by any person, organization or business;

f) To adopt all necessary measures, including legislative ones, to modify or eliminate laws, rules, uses and practices which constitute discrimination against women;

g) To eliminate all national penal dispositions which constitute discrimination against women.

National Constitution

In 2003, the Committee recommended to the State that the Penal Code impose sanctions, with full force, over serious crimes to and violations of women's rights, that it

take all possible measures to ensure the protection and rehabilitation of victims, and that it embark upon necessary study and analysis that will enable the government to effectively act against these problems.

The Executive Decree to enact the “National Action Plan for Human Rights”, signed June 24, 1998, states in Article 26 that the government will ensure “... that the State's security mechanisms and agents will not commit acts of persecution and imprisonment of people because of their sexual choices!”. Additionally, Article 23.3 of the 1998 Constitution, in reference to personal freedom affirms the condemnation of cruel and unusual punishment, torture; any procedure which is inhumane, degrading or implying physical or sexual violence; moral coercion; and the application and use of human genetic material. Therefore the state would adopt necessary mechanisms to prevent, eliminate and condemn, in particular, violence against children, adolescents, women and the elderly. It is true that the 1998 Constitution made a particular reference to violence against children, adolescents, women and the elderly. Nonetheless, a lack of State protection continues to exist for women with different sexual orientations and who do not conform to the stereotypical model of a biological woman.

These omissions in the Law, despite the promise of the right to non-discrimination in Article 23 of the Constitution, result in the continued violations of lesbian women's human rights with impunity, even in cases in which these violations are systematic as in the city of Guayaquil.

Therefore, it is the responsibility of the State, to enact modifications regarding the current dialogues and practices in society, which are marked by intolerance, prejudices, myths and mandates towards sexual orientation and/or gender identity which differ from the parameters defined by the heterosexual, patriarchal tradition.

We ask the Honorable Committee to recommend to the State of Ecuador:
2.1 To investigate the complaints made regarding cases of torture and mistreatment of lesbian women in private clinics, and apply the appropriate procedures and sanctions. And, with input from civil society, develop ways in which to prevent and impose sanctions upon these violations of human rights.
2.2. To support the formulation of an antidiscrimination mechanism and legal reforms corresponding to the civil, penal and procedural means to bring about sanctions upon discriminatory acts and to restore violated rights.
2.3. To include hate crimes in the Penal Code.

Article 3- Guarantees about basic human rights and fundamental freedoms.
The Ecuadorian State has not adopted the appropriate measures in the political, social, economic and cultural spheres in order to “… ensure the total development and advance of women, with the goal of guaranteeing them the exercise and enjoyment of human rights and fundamental liberties in equal conditions”. Therefore, women remain in unequal conditions regarding access to education, medical services and dignified work with equitable salaries. Significant examples are the continued violation of the rights included in Articles 36, 67 and 41 of the 1998 Constitution, respectively. Evidence of these violations include the expulsion of young lesbians from educational institutions;

17 Amnesty International, 1991
18 By not recognizing their discrimination, these women are treated outside of the canons of humanity, which are applied to other social groups.
the denial of the right to one's identity and body in the case of trans women; impediments to trans women's enrollment in the educational system; forced migration because of sexual orientation; denial of the right to protection of the family; untimely dismissal; and the denial of the right to shelter, to health and to quality, dignified treatment. Therefore, in reality all of these practices are discriminatory and they exclude or deny the exercise of rights.

**Other significant examples in workplaces, educational institutions and health centers are as follows:**

**Discrimination in Educational Institutions**

“The truth: I stopped studying at the Santiago Catholic University in Guayaquil; being a transgender woman in transition did not allow me to continue. This was due to the professors and other officials who, upon seeing my body in transition, retaliated against me and harassed me in every sense of the word. It was a violation of my right to personal safety. They lowered my morale to the point of lowering my grades, so that they can exclude me from the university.

Mistreatment, the nightmares, the low morale that these people brought me to, depressed me to the point of wanting to die. I was disappointed in myself, and I began to have trouble in my job for the same reasons. All had to do with what was happening inside of me. It's not right that, because you decide to change your gender, you lose the opportunity to progress and move forward, it is so calamitous to try to conform to society in the way that people want. In truth, those people kicked me out of the university; I lost two years of study, now that I am almost a transgender woman. This act has remained unpunished to this day, because there is no law here in Ecuador that protects us in incidents regarding gender identity19.

The young boys that suffer because of their family, discrimination by the family, are treated by psychologists, psychiatrists, to try to convert them because they are the shame of the family, and they are kicked out of the house. They try to pretend that they are men while at home. They live double lives; they are discriminated against by their own families. One boy's family cut his hair and shaved his head so that he would not continue on a bad path, which caused him to leave home, there is a lot of discrimination from the family20.

Discrimination in the health arena has also been a constant for trans women, violating one of the fundamental rights, at times in which they require emergency services:

“In health centers, there has been discrimination in different forms, one of which is in emergency care. They have to provide emergency care. Trans people spurtng blood are not attended to. They leave them in bad shape. One had a chest wound and they realized that they had not taken good care of [that person]21”.

These acts violate the mentioned articles and those that refer to the development of

21 Interview on Red Trans de El Oro, 2008.
one's sense of self. This, as well, violated basic human rights such as: the right to integrity and personal security, and to an end of violence against lesbian and trans women.

**We recommend to the State**

3.1 That the norm in education, health and labor reflect the principle of equality and not of discrimination, as much in public establishments as in private ones, and that related public policies are developed, facilitating the inclusion of trans women.

3.2 That public policies are developed which facilitate access to education, the work force and medical services.

3.3 To implement training programs in order to develop a sensitivity to gender identity, gender expression and sexual orientation of staff in the educational, medical and labor forces.

**Article 4: Special temporary methods for reaching equality**

The Ecuadorian state, up to this point, has not taken special effective measures to eradicate the discrimination of and lack of protection for women, particularly lesbians, transsexuals and *travestis* in urgent situations, such as imprisonment in private “rehabilitation” clinics, violence on the streets due to transphobia and hate crimes.

**We ask the Honorable Committee to recommend to the Ecuadorian State:**

4.1 The implementation of special methods of protection for lesbian and trans women, with the aim of protecting them from violence and abuse committed by police, family members, public and private institutions.

4.2 To elaborate upon and implement concrete mechanisms combating the social and economic marginalization which affects young lesbian women, *travestis* and transsexual in particular, in addition to many lesbians and bisexuals.

**Article 5: Censorship, gender stereotypes and prejudices about sexuality**

From the inception of this government, a change has not been promoted regarding gender stereotypes and prejudices around gender identity and sexuality. Despite the government's promotion of equality and its opposition to violence against women as State policies, in Ecuadorian society one can see a homophobic and transphobic structure. Examples of this are the cases documented in this decade.

Additionally, various legislative proposals were not taken into consideration.

“Following the death of Jenina Fuentes, we have begun to announce that several murders are taking place, with the same type of genital mutilation and cuts on the face as a symbol of transphobia, due to their aesthetic focus. Corpses are plundered in trashcans. We are identifying and arguing judicially that these three signs, more than other circumstances, convey that, when put together, they form hate crimes and we introduce this figure for the first time because in Ecuador we haven't really spoken about hate crimes due to transphobia; on this basis, in July 2004 we presented--with the endorsement of other civil society organizations--a project of reforms to the Penal Code to define hate crimes... In June of this year, we presented a legislative proposal to prevent and eliminate all forms of discrimination. The antidiscrimination proposal reached second debates in Congress, while the Penal Code proposal was not even distributed in parliament,
which is only the first step in the procedure”.

In the last few months, in relation to the current constitutional debate, Catholic and Evangelical groups rejected any type of constitutional reform that would protect or guarantee LGBTTI rights. This is particularly the case in respect to marriage and the family. For that reason, the respective article in the proposed Constitution states that “... marriage is the union between a man and a woman” and the right of adoption [is limited to] heterosexual couples. This is despite the current recommendations of the Convention regarding the conception of a family.

In this sense, the State is in violation of Article 5 of the Convention, as it has not initiated a reform to eradicate stereotypes against identities which differ from heterosexuality and gender normativity.

We ask the Honorable Committee to recommend to the Ecuadorian State:
5.1. To develop programs on forming and sensitizing the public in order to transform current structural conceptions in Ecuadorian society, which are based on homophobia and transphobia.
5.2. To promote sensitivity around issues of sexual diversity and human rights in Ecuadorian society.

Questions:

Article 1:
What concrete measures has the State taken to extend the concept of anti-discrimination to include gender identity?
What measures has the Ecuadorian State taken--as it stated in its 2003 Report--to effectively include women as they identify themselves, in terms of sexual orientation and gender identity?
How will the State guarantee that the proposals from distinct groups will be welcomed, independently of the Constitutional Reform?

Article 2:
How will the new proposed Constitution enact the principles of equality and the guarantees to make this right effective? How, and through which mechanisms, will the rights of LGBTTI people be protected against acts of discrimination and in all arenas, private as well as public?
What concrete steps are being taken to investigate claims of torture and abuse against sexual minorities committed by health professionals and police? Have any methods been implemented to stop these incidents from occurring in the future?

Article 3
Through which concrete political, judicial and legislative measures is the State going to ensure and cause all GLBTTT women--in accordance with Article 3--to be able to exercise and enjoy human rights and fundamental freedoms, in equal conditions to those of other citizens?

22 Interview with Elizabeth Vásquez.
23 As an example, take the experience of Casa Trans as a civil society initiative that can be turned into public policy. This initiative came from trans people going to villages and working door to door, talking with neighbors.
What methods have been implemented to remedy situations of inequality in educational, health and workplace institutions?

**Article 4**
What temporary, urgent measures has the Ecuadorian State developed in order to eradicate the different forms of discrimination against lesbian women and transsexuals in the streets, private spaces, workplaces and educational institutions?

**Article 5**
What measures is the Ecuadorian State taking in order to eliminate the prejudices and stereotypes, which permit and ensure the existence of different forms of discrimination based on gender identity and sexual orientation?

**Bibliography**


Medise Movimiento por la Diversidad Sexual, Cuasana, Taller de Comunicación Mujer. *Demands of the LGBTIQ Movement of Quito for the Fulfillment of Commitments Made by the Ecuadorian State Before the Human Rights Council during the Universal Periodic Review*.


Taller de Comunicación Mujer, Causana and Elizabeth Vasquéz (2005). *Regional Tribunal on Social, Economic and Cultural Rights of Women*. Quito, CDES

